PB Works – Outcomes, Accountability and Evaluation
Crescent Arts Centre, Tuesday 18th September 2018
Dr Louise O’Kane – Welcome
PB Works Project

• BCT: Civic Activism Programme
• Collaborative effort
• Raise awareness of and advocate for Participatory Budgeting (PB)
• Tailored Support - working with PB Partners and Democratic Society
• PB Works Website www.participatorybudgetingworks.org
• Join the PB Works Network
PB PARTNERS

Independent social enterprise that is working to empower citizens

- Supporting new ways of doing PB
- Community engagement specialists

PB Network: Advocating for PB across the UK

www.pbnetwork.org.uk

and supporting PB in Scotland

https://pbscotland.scot
WHAT IS PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING?

‘PB directly involves local people in making decisions on the spending and priorities for a defined public budget.’

If it feels like we have decided it’s PB. If it feels like someone else has decided, it isn’t.’
POSSIBLE PB MODELS

Participatory grant making
Money spent within communities by local groups...
(With lots of involvement in the decision)

Mainstream Investment
Money spent by public bodies as directed by citizens...
(With lots of involvement in the decision)

How ... varies widely based on local co-design and the context
PB budget cycle = participatory activity at all stages

Building participation through repeated cycles
Tools for reporting on PB Outcomes

PB Network’s Case Study Template
(what, when, where, why, who and how)

SQW national evaluation of PB in England:
Cost/benefit review from an external perspective

The PB Unit Self Evaluation guide:
Academic designed, focussing on capturing qualitative (and quantitative) evidence

WhatWorksScotland’s reviews
Tools for reporting on PB Outcomes

PB Partners Evaluation Guide
1. Agree outcomes before you start
2. Establish your baseline
3. Regularly gather feedback
4. Ask participants what they felt
5. Keep track of the numbers
6. Use films to tell the story
7. Hold a stakeholder reflection event
8. Follow what happens next
9. Use external experts as critical friends
10. Share your learning
Seven Defining Characteristics for PB

1. That **directing public budgets** is the primary focus of the process.
2. Citizen **participation has an impact** on the budget.
3. Citizens can shape **the rules governing the process**.
4. The process has a **deliberative** element.
5. The process seeks to **redistribute resources** on the basis of need.
6. Designed to ensure that **citizens can monitor** public spending.
7. Its **repeated** periodically.

Adapted from:
https://democracy-spot.net/2012/09/12/participatory-budgeting-seven-defining-characteristics/

Can we design measures for these?
And how complicated are they?
Public Agenda’s PB key metrics (another framework)

Impact on Civic and Political Life:

Does PB engage a significant and growing number of residents, including those who cannot or do not participate in mainstream political life?

Does PB foster collaboration between civil society organizations and government?

Is PB associated with elected officials’ political careers?

Impact on Inclusion and Equity:

Is PB engaging traditionally marginalized communities?

Does PB facilitate participation?

Is PB fostering a more equitable distribution of resources?

Impact on Government:

Number of PB processes and amounts allocated to PB changing from year to year?

Implementation rate of winning PB projects?

Are additional resources being allocated to projects or needs identified through PB?

Cost to government of implementing PB?
Open Government

The Open Government Partnership is a multilateral initiative that aims to secure concrete commitments from governments to:

promote transparency, empower citizens, fight corruption, and harness new technologies to strengthen governance.
Transparency in Practice

Left column reads: Where the money comes from...

Right column reads: What the money is spent on...

Below it says: *When the administration is transparent, everything works smoothly...*

*From the participatory budget of Icapui, Brazil.*
Audit Perfection? ... or Good Enough PB?

My challenges, or questions... to you...

How effective is our existing spend?
Does money go where it should, and do what it should?
Let’s compare PB against reality, not perfection.

Asking citizens what to cut is like ....
Asking them if they want their toe or a finger removed first

The complexity of arrangements for monitoring will depend on:

✓ the size of the organisation
✓ the availability of administrative staff
✓ appropriate systems.

“If we stopped counting things we could cut our costs by 15%”
Opportunities and Challenges in PB?

**Effective Audit**
- What do we DESIRE?
- What do we WANT?
- What do we NEED?

**Democratic Accountability**
- What VALUES drive us?
- What PROBLEMS face us?
- What can we BUILD upon?

**Evaluating Impacts**
- What TOOLS could we use?
- What SKILLS can we draw on?
- What ACTIONS need to happen?

The TEMPLE OF PB
Learning from Scotland
Scotland’s Participatory Budgeting Journey

Kathleen Glazik
Policy Manager
Community Empowerment Unit
- National Policy Context
- Legislative background
- Scotland’s PB Journey to date
- Key Milestones
- Evaluation
Policy Context

- **Scottish Community Empowerment Action Plan – 2009**
  Key to achieving a more successful Scotland is communities doing things for themselves.

- **Christie Commission – 2011**
  People should have equal opportunity to participate and have their voice heard in decisions shaping their local community and society.

- **Commission on Strengthening Local Democracy - 2014**
  That a process of PB, covering tax and spending options, is adopted by all local governments to enhance local choices over tax and spend within a new system of local government finance.

- **Referendum – September 2014**
  Harnessing the Democratic Energy
Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015

- It creates new rights for community bodies and new duties on public authorities.

- makes it easier for communities to take on public sector land and buildings.

- It provides a mechanism for community bodies to seek dialogue with public sector providers on their own terms.
11 Parts in the Act

- Participation Requests improving Services
- Community Right to Buy Land
- CPP Locality Plans disadvantaged areas
- Participation in Public Decision Making
- Community Involvement in Forestry Leasing
- Establish a Register for Common Good Property
- Asset Transfer Buy or Lease Land & Buildings
- Non Domestic Rates for Councils
- Allotments
- Football Clubs Supporters Rights
- National Outcomes
- National Outcomes
PB - Our aim in 2014

- Support and promote PB as a tool for community engagement and as a resource to widen participatory democracy.

- Raise awareness, provide practical support and funding.

- Put conditions in place for PB to be delivered in a meaningful and sustainable way across Scotland.
Scottish Government Funding
Community Choices Fund
Key Milestones

Landmark Agreement
£100 million by 2021

At least 1% of local government budgets will be subject to PB by 2021.

All of Scotland’s 32 Local Authorities
PB in Schools

PB in schools will:

• Build more confident and active young citizens
• Provide a real experience of democracy in action.
• Provides awareness of wider community needs and ways of addressing them.
• Develops research, interviewing and presentation skills.
• Builds useful skills in budgeting and financial literacy.

PB is included in the Pupil Equity Fund Operational Guidelines for Head Teachers as “an innovative and effective mechanism to engage with parents and pupils, in particular those who face barriers to participation”.
Recommendation

Inclusive Engagement

Develop a PB Framework to tackle barriers to include:

- Better Planning and Design
- Enable Deliberation
- Embed a Test & Learn Culture
Developing a PB Charter for Scotland

Values & Principles

The Charter will be co-produced with the PB Scotland Network and stakeholders.
Local Governance Review

Democracy Matters

The way we live our lives is constantly changing; just think of all the changes that have happened in your lifetime. Democracy is changing too. It used to be that most citizens were content to cast their vote and then leave the decisions to others. Increasingly people want to share in making those decisions, or at least have a greater understanding as to why certain decisions have been made on their behalf. In order to make democracy work better for everyone, and especially for those who feel left out, we are asking people all over Scotland:
Evaluation & Impact
Evaluation: Implications for practice and policy

- Living up to expectations and ‘principles’ of participatory budgeting requires improvements and clarity in articulating the purpose and intention of participatory budgeting.

- Building capacity and competence for meaningful and sustainable participation within communities, local authorities and partnerships.

- Policy and legislative drivers for Participatory Budgeting e.g. the Public Sector Equality Duty.

- Strategic engagement with 1%
Scotland on the world stage!

Kathleen in Jalisco

Fiona in Arizona

Jez in Taiwan

We’re talked about in Kuala Lumpur!

Participatory budgeting in Scotland
Contact

Kathleen.glazik@gov.scot

Tel: 0131 244 0831
Mainstreaming PB
Mainstreaming Participatory Budgeting

Simon Cameron
Development Manager – Participatory Budgeting
Convention of Scottish Local Authorities
The Scottish PB journey

• Where PB fits
• Where we were
• Where we are
• Where we’re going
• Where next

www.cosla.gov.uk @cosla COSLA
Where PB fits

- Community engagement
- Building participatory democracy in Scotland.
- People have equal opportunity to have their voice heard in decisions about them and their community.
- Part of Public Service Reform, Local Governance Review, Open Government Programme

www.cosla.gov.uk   @cosla   COSLA
Where we were:

- £1.75 million invested in 1st Generation PB in Scotland
- 58 PB processes funded over 2009 to 2016
- £28,400 average funding allocated per PB process
- £750 to £200,000 PB process funding varied greatly

- £9,300 average expenditure per PB project
- Projects targeted thematically, demographically and geographically
- 179 PB projects funded diverse and vibrant range of funded projects
- 77% of PB processes funded by Scottish Government

- 57% of PB processes were located in South West of Scotland
- 7% of PB processes were located in rural areas
- 90% of PB processes were located in disadvantaged areas
- One fifth of PB processes articulated aim of addressing inequalities

Please note: all data presented in this info-graphic are estimates only, and based on incomplete information. Please see the Review Findings section of this report for details of missing data.
Where we are:

£1.7m Community Choices Fund 16/17

- 19,017 People at Events
- 39,484 Voters
- 122 Events
- 2,058 Projects Voted On
- 1,349 Projects Successful

£2,511,438 Distributed through Community Choices to Projects throughout Scotland

Source: SG PB Evaluation Report (October 2017)
Scottish Government and COSLA agree that at least 1% of local government budgets will be subject to participatory budgeting by the end of 2021.
• 1% is the minimum target set
• can be from any budget
• Target timescale is 2020/21
• For local authorities to decide how to take forward at a local level
• Framework Document:
  http://www.cosla.gov.uk/community-choices-1-framework-agreement
Impact so far?

- Communities
- Services
- Democracy
- Tackling inequality
Where next?

- Define mainstream PB
- Be clear on opportunities and challenges
- Embed as part of how we work
- Ensure it is used across the public and third sectors

www.cosla.gov.uk  @cosla  COSLA
Contact

simonc@cosla.gov.uk
Development Manager, Participatory Budgeting
Tel: 0131 474 9261

Participatory Budgeting Website
www.PBScotland.scot
Measuring outcomes
Public Audit in Scotland

Our role: To give independent assurance to the people of Scotland that public money is spent properly and provides value for money.

We audit:
- 226 bodies
- around £40 billion public spending each year
Audit Scotland – audit dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial sustainability</th>
<th>Financial management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Can short-term (current and next year) financial balance be achieved?</td>
<td>✓ Is financial management effective?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Is there a long-term (5-10 years) financial strategy?</td>
<td>✓ Are budget setting and monitoring processes operating effectively?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Is investment effective?</td>
<td>✓ Is there enough financial capacity?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Governance and transparency</th>
<th>Value for money</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Is governance effective?</td>
<td>✓ Are resources used effectively?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Is there effective leadership?</td>
<td>✓ Are services improving?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Is decision making transparent?</td>
<td>✓ Is Best Value demonstrated?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Is there transparent reporting of financial and performance information?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [Code of Practice](http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk) Audit Dimensions and Smaller Bodies Supplementary guidance
Why community empowerment matters

Scale of the ambition
New expectations on all public bodies & implications across many policy areas, but public bodies are at the early stages of realising the full ambitions of the Act.
• How can we support public bodies and share learning and good practice?

Changes to public services
Potential to change the way public services are delivered and potential to improve outcomes
• How will we know it’s happening?
• Will better engagement lead to improved outcomes?
• What should we be looking for? E.g. engaging with hard to reach groups? Increasing community capacity? Effective cultural and behavioural change? Impact and outcomes?

New operating environment
The wider policy landscape also gives traction to involving people differently e.g. includes IJBs, SDS, Community Justice etc..
• What are the implications on local practice across different policy areas?
Community empowerment advisory group has reps from SSG plus:
Scottish Government, COSLA, Health Scotland
Inspiring Scotland, SURF, N Ayrshire Council,
Scottish Community Development Centre,
The Consultation Institute, Stratagem Int.,
Scottish Community Safety Network,
Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations,
What Works Scotland, Scottish Health Council,
Forest Enterprise Scotland,
Improvement Service
Approach to Community empowerment (1)

**Stage 1 (2017)**
- Learning together about community empowerment and building relationships to develop a shared view and approach
  - Roundtables on community empowerment (CE)
  - External engagement
  - CE built in to new best value and assurance audit work
  - Blogs
  - Initial discussions at SSG

**Stage 2 (2018)**
- Developing a number of initiatives to test and bring together our work to strengthen approach in this area
  - Establishing short life Advisory Group
  - Review of LOIPS
  - Review of BV toolkits and auditor guidance
  - Support for teams
  - Gathering examples of local practice
  - Planning future work on CE
  - Updates on progress to SSG

**Stage 3 (2019)**
- Embedding community empowerment in our work to assess the extent to which communities are empowered as part of local decision making
  - CE approaches embedded in scrutiny activity
  - Clear examples of how community empowerment is being addressed through routine audit work
Approach to Community engagement (2)

Review of Local Improvement Outcome Plans (LOIPs)

- Developed a template for evaluating LOIPs

Briefing paper for auditors carrying our Best Value audits:
- Background on CE, what it means for audit
- Prompts and case studies
  - Local people driving activity
  - Public bodies driving the activity
  - Potential methodology – documents, interviewees, focus groups, observation at meetings/ community events
  - Examples from previous reports
  - Tools public bodies may be using
Some examples from our audits

Local Government Overview 2018
• Good examples of CE, including how councils consult with, listen to and work with local people and communities, but still early days.
• Examples of PB – communities voting on how a £600k road repairs fund should be used, PB guides and evaluation toolkit to help councils.

Good examples of Community Empowerment/ Participatory Budgeting
• City of Glasgow Council BVAR, Aug 18 - Thriving Places - council’s targeted approach to working with disadvantaged communities.
• East Ayrshire Council BVAR, May 18 - The council is fully committed to empowering its residents and includes people in planning services and spending public money.
• Other examples – Fife council, Inverclyde council, councils consulting with communities on CE/PB, £240K of Tackling Poverty Fund for PB.
Embedding our approach to CE/PB

Auditing outcomes
- Increased focus on linking spending to outcomes
- Updates to the National Performance Framework (NPF) with a focus on CE + addressing poverty and inequalities

Assessing how public bodies are addressing inequalities
- Working towards embedding this in our audits – public sector responsibilities under the Equalities Act.
- Community Empowerment Act has an ambition to reduce inequalities

Plan to produce a briefing on community empowerment in 2019.
Contact details

Jillian Matthew, Senior Manager
Performance Audit & Best Value
Audit Scotland, 102 West Port, Edinburgh EH3 9DN
Tel. 0131 625 1844
Email: jmatthew@audit-Scotland.gov.uk

www.audit-scotland.gov.uk
https://twitter.com/AuditScotland
https://www.facebook.com/AuditScotland/
https://www.linkedin.com/company/audit-scotland/
Panel – Questions and Answers
Table Discussion
Opportunities of PB in NI and meeting the challenges of outcomes, accountability and evaluating engagement
Reflections from Kathleen, Simon and Jillian
Supporting a way forward for PB in NI?
Participatory Budgeting can be described as "Local People deciding how to allocate part of a public budget."

www.participatorybudgetingworks.org

The PB Works Network is free and open to anyone who is interested in participatory budgeting.

Network members are invited to contribute their ideas, learning and enthusiasm to advancing PB across the region.

BECOME A MEMBER

Having trouble with the form? Contact louise@communityplaces.info
FIND OUT MORE
RESOURCES

LINKS TO PB IN ACTION

- HOLYWELL STEW

VIDEO

- YOUR VOICE, YOUR CHOICE

DOCUMENT

- MAKING PEOPLE COUNT

VIDEO

- PB CASE STUDY
  The City of Edinburgh Council and the Loth Partnership

DOCUMENT

- DUNDEE DECIDES

PB SUPPORT WEBSITES

- TRIANGLE
  'Vote for Fun'

DOCUMENT

- TRIANGLE HOUSING ASSOCIATION VOTE FOR FUN

VIDEO
Evaluation
Thank-you for participating
Roundtable - Policy and Practice

What will it take to maintain momentum?
What are the main opportunities and barriers?